

Before the Hearings Commissioners at Wellington City Council

under: the Resource Management Act 1991

in the matter of: an application by Ryman Healthcare Limited for resource consent to construct, operate and maintain a comprehensive care retirement village at 26 Donald Street and 37 Campbell Street, Karori, Wellington

between: **Ryman Healthcare Limited**
Applicant

and: **Wellington City Council**
Consent Authority

Statement of evidence of **Matthew Glen Brown** on behalf of Ryman Healthcare Limited

Dated: 29 August 2022

Reference: Luke Hinchey (luke.hinchey@chapmantripp.com)
Nicola de Wit (nicola.dewit@chapmantripp.com)

chapmantripp.com
T +64 9 357 9000
F +64 9 357 9099

PO Box 2206
Auckland 1140
New Zealand

Auckland
Wellington
Christchurch



STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF MATTHEW GLEN BROWN ON BEHALF OF RYMAN HEALTHCARE LIMITED

INTRODUCTION

- 1 My full name is Matthew Glen Brown.
- 2 I hold a New Zealand Certificate in Mechanical Engineering.
- 3 I am the New Zealand Development Manager for Ryman Healthcare Limited (*Ryman*). I have held this role since March 2020. Prior to that time, I held the role of Senior Development Manager since September 2018. Prior to joining Ryman, I was the NZ Development Manager for an aged care provider since June 2011.
- 4 I manage the development of Ryman's retirement villages in New Zealand until they become operational. The key development phases include site acquisition, concept design and the resource consent process, followed by construction, commissioning and handover to the Operations Team. I am responsible for general management of the New Zealand development team and consultant inputs into our resource consent application for the Proposed Village. I also lead our stakeholder and Council engagement, as well as community consultation.
- 5 I have been responsible for Ryman's resource consent application to Wellington City Council (*Council*) to construct and operate a comprehensive care retirement village (*Proposed Village*) at 26 Donald Street and 37 Campbell Street, Karori, Wellington (*Site*).

SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

- 6 My evidence will address the following:
 - 6.1 Overview of the Proposed Village;
 - 6.2 Ryman's philosophy;
 - 6.3 Why Ryman has chosen the Site;
 - 6.4 Consultation and engagement with stakeholders and the community;
 - 6.5 My response to the public submissions;
 - 6.6 My response to the Council Officer's Report (*Officer's Report*); and
 - 6.7 My conclusions.

OVERVIEW

- 7 Ryman is New Zealand's leading retirement village operator. Ryman was established in Christchurch in 1984 and now operates 38 retirement villages across New Zealand, including five villages in the Wellington region.
- 8 Ryman is committed to providing the highest quality housing and care for Wellington's elderly residents in its villages. I am therefore very pleased to present this application for a new comprehensive care retirement village in Karori.
- 9 The Site is located in the highly desirable and established community of Karori in close proximity to shops, services and transport links. The Site is also ideally suited for the Proposed Village given its large size and being identified as suitable for residential development. The Site was a prominent part of the Karori community when it housed the former Teachers' College and I consider the establishment of the Proposed Village will ensure the Site continues to have an important community role.
- 10 When built, the Proposed Village will provide a full range of housing and care options for older persons, comprising of independent living apartments, assisted living suites, and rest home, hospital and dementia care. The Proposed Village is urgently needed. Ryman already has a list of over 440 people who have expressed an interest in living in the Proposed Village without any official marketing. This interest shows the desperate need for a comprehensive care retirement village in the area. I would go so far as to say the current under-provision of care in Wellington is at a crisis point and needs to be urgently addressed. The strong demand for the Proposed Village also shows that Ryman is recognised as a high quality, resident-focused and trusted operator.
- 11 It is perhaps obvious, but also in my view reasonable, that people want to remain living in the area that they have helped create and lived in for decades. The Proposed Village will allow residents from Karori and surrounding neighbourhoods to move into purpose built accommodation while maintaining close links with their families, friends and amenities that are familiar to them. The ability to 'age in place' and to be part of a community of retirees in a Ryman retirement village has proven benefits in terms of improving the quality of life for elderly people.
- 12 Our residents are Ryman's key priority. The design of the Proposed Village is tailor-made for the future residents' comfort and to improve their quality of life. The Proposed Village will provide appropriate accommodation and care for its future residents, with a layout and environment designed to meet the specific physical and social needs of elderly people.

- 13 I am very proud of the overall design of the Proposed Village. Ryman has put significant effort into producing a high quality design. Ryman’s architectural team has been guided by leading consultants throughout the design process, including Ms Rebecca Skidmore and Mr Andrew Burns. Because of the history of the Site, Ryman also engaged a heritage architect, Mr David Pearson, to provide inputs into the design of the Village. Ryman sets very high standards for its villages and is renowned for providing a high quality living environment for all of our residents.
- 14 With advice from a team of highly qualified and experienced experts, the Site has been designed so the buildings, accessways and open spaces carefully respond to the characteristics of the Site and the surrounding environment:
- 14.1 The Proposed Village will restore and reuse the Allen Ward VC Hall, the Tennant Block and the Oldershaw Octagonal Block. The preservation and adaptation of these buildings, along with the Lopdell Gardens, will ensure the Site’s heritage and its past role as a Teachers’ College is celebrated and maintained. The new village buildings have been designed to integrate well with the retained buildings.
- 14.2 The Proposed Village has also been designed to make a positive contribution to the character of the surrounding environment. Ryman’s team has chosen appropriate design features, building articulation and variation of building materials across the Proposed Village to ensure positive urban design outcomes that complement the existing and planned built environment;
- 14.3 The Proposed Village has been designed to “be a good neighbour” to adjoining properties. It was designed to comply with the built form standards of the Operative Wellington City Council District Plan (*Operative Plan*) to the greatest extent practicable. At residential boundaries, the Proposed Village comfortably complies with the standards. We carefully consider the amenity of our neighbours throughout the design process; and
- 14.4 The landscape planting for the Proposed Village has been designed by Sullivan and Wall Landscapes to achieve a park-like setting. The landscaping will provide a high standard of amenity for both the residents of the Proposed Village and for neighbours and the public. Ryman’s fragrant and colourful gardens are highly valued by its residents. Full-time maintenance staff will actively manage the planting to ensure the on-going amenity of the landscaping is maintained.
- 15 Ryman will make a significant investment during the construction of the Proposed Village, providing jobs and other flow-on economic benefits to the local community, the construction industry, and

Wellington's economy more generally. This economic stimulus is particularly important during New Zealand's recovery from the economic and social impacts of COVID-19.

- 16 The Proposed Village also has a number of other very important community benefits. As residents move into the village, they will sell their family home. This is expected to release approximately 300 family homes back onto the market to be more efficiently used again by families.
- 17 Residents that cannot cope independently in their own home are sometimes effectively forced to live in hospitals, as there is no acceptable accommodation providing needs-driven residential care available due to a shortage of beds. This is known as 'bed-blocking'. The Proposed Village will assist to reduce bed-blocking in hospitals.
- 18 The Proposed Village will also provide ongoing benefits during its lifetime, with staff being employed to manage and operate it, and local suppliers being used to provide goods and services. Ryman is already investing in the local economy by supporting local organisations and projects, such as sponsoring the Karori Bowling Club, Karori Bridge Club and Karori Golf Club and the Karori Residents Association Security Patrol Vehicle.
- 19 A range of submissions were received in relation to the Proposed Village. I am pleased that around half of the submissions actively support the Proposed Village. Submitters identify Ryman as a reputable operator of retirement villages that are of a very high standard. A number of submissions identify the Site as appropriately located for a retirement village and the Proposed Village design as high quality. Other submissions support the increased housing that the Proposed Village will bring to the city, the investment in the local economy, the reduction in pressures on the health system and the conversion of an unused and deteriorating site into a safe and attractive environment.
- 20 Importantly, I wish to acknowledge the support of the Karori Residents Association, which represents the wider community, for the Proposed Village. Their submission states, "*it is time to get this project moving*". We agree.
- 21 I acknowledge that some submitters have concerns with the Proposed Village, including its design and character, traffic impacts, and construction impacts. That said, many of those submitters also accept that the Site is suitable for a retirement village overall. I will outline Ryman's response to some of those concerns later in this evidence.
- 22 Overall, I consider the Proposed Village will be a very positive addition to Karori and will provide broad benefits to the community. I have no doubt whatsoever that the Proposed Village will meet the

needs of the elderly residents who will live there and will create a fantastic living environment. The Proposed Village will have significant positive effects as a whole, by providing much needed accommodation and care for one of the city's most vulnerable age groups.

RYMAN'S PHILOSOPHY

Introduction to Ryman

- 23 Ryman has been operating in New Zealand since 1984 and currently has 38 retirement villages in operation across New Zealand. Our villages provide homes for more than 13,200 elderly residents and employ over 6,700 people. Ryman currently operates five retirement villages in the Wellington region: Bob Scott in Petone, Charles Fleming in Waikanae, Malvina Major in Khandallah, Rita Angus in Kilbernie, and Shona McFarlane in Lower Hutt.
- 24 Ryman is considered to be a pioneer in many aspects of the healthcare industry – including retirement village design, standards of care, and staff education. High quality, purpose built villages are at the core of Ryman's philosophy. We at Ryman are passionately committed to providing the best environment and care for our residents. A quality site, living environment, amenities and the best care maximises quality of life for our residents. Ryman has extensive knowledge and expertise in the construction and operation of purpose-built retirement villages that meet the needs of the community.
- 25 Ryman does not consider itself a developer, as it is responsible for the whole-of-life of its retirement villages. This spans the acquisition of land, through the design and consenting processes, to construction, through to all aspects of operation and maintenance of the accommodation, care and amenities within the Proposed Village. As both a constructor and operator of retirement villages, Ryman has a long-term interest in its villages, its residents and the communities its villages are located in.
- 26 The expertise that Ryman has developed in caring for elderly residents has resulted in the company being awarded 'Best Retirement Village in New Zealand' at the Australasian Aged Care Industry Awards on six occasions. Ryman has also been awarded 'Most Trusted Brand' in the aged care and retirement industry of the Readers Digest awards on eight occasions.

The retirement living and care crisis

- 27 The lack of retirement and aged care across New Zealand, and in Wellington city, is at crisis point.
- 28 The ageing population is fuelling this crisis. In the Wellington region, the 75+ population is expected to grow from 31,155 in 2018 to 78,400 in 2043. In Wellington city, the 75+ population is expected to grow from 8,681 in 2018 to 23,643 in 2048. In Karori

the 75+ population is expected to grow from 810 in 2018 to 3,860 in 2048.

- 29 Already, the demand for quality living options up to a standard that is acceptable to retirees is significantly higher than the current supply. The existing supply of care is also decreasing due to closures of small, poor quality, aged care homes of the past, which are usually conversions of old houses that simply are not up to standard.
- 30 There are currently six retirement villages in Wellington City, with a further four in development. The total capacity of these ten villages will be just over 1,000 units for around 1,400 residents. The existing and consented retirement villages will be entirely inadequate to meet the increasing demand.
- 31 In my view, our older people deserve purpose built homes that exceed Building Code requirements with a high quality, safe and warm environment where they are able to go about their day-to-day lives comfortably. Retirement housing should be to a standard that people choose to live in, rather than inappropriate buildings that they are forced to live in because there is no choice in the market.
- 32 Ryman is the largest provider of comprehensive care retirement villages in New Zealand. In Ryman's experience, each new retirement village is fully allocated before construction is fully complete.
- 33 The crisis is worsening and the gap is widening. Many older people are being deprived of appropriate care and companionship at a stage of their lives when they are most in need. This is one reason why the efficient use of suitable sites need to be maximised, as such sites are rare in established residential areas.

Retirement Village typologies

- 34 'Retirement Village' is an umbrella term given to all types of retirement living. There are two different types of retirement villages, 'lifestyle retirement villages' and 'comprehensive care villages':
 - 34.1 Lifestyle retirement villages focus mostly on independent living units with a small amount of serviced care on a largely temporary basis. When a resident becomes frailer over time, usually they would be forced to leave a lifestyle village as the provision of serviced care is usually not suitable as a long term solution. Relocating into a new and unfamiliar environment at this time is often very stressful for residents.
 - 34.2 Comprehensive care retirement villages provide a full range of living options to residents, providing a 'continuum of care' from independent living to serviced care, rest home, hospital and dementia level care within the same village. This

'continuum of care' approach allows residents to remain in the same 'home' as their needs change. Comprehensive care retirement villages have an approximately 50:50 ratio of independent and care units.

- 35 There is a fundamental difference between a comprehensive care retirement village and a lifestyle retirement village. Each village type attracts a different resident demographic. The average age of residents moving into comprehensive care retirement villages is early 80's, with an overall average age in the mid to late 80's. These residents usually choose to live in their own homes for as long as possible and move to a retirement village primarily due to a specific need (e.g. deteriorating health, mobility, or for companionship). Lifestyle villages cater for a younger, more active, early retiree. The average age of a resident moving into a lifestyle village is approximately late 60's.

Ryman's villages

- 36 Ryman's comprehensive care retirement villages provide a range of retirement living and care options, including independent living. We also provide the full range of care options, including assisted living, rest-home, hospital and dementia level care. Approximately half the residents in our villages live in residential aged care. The ability to provide a continuum of care from an independent lifestyle to 24-hour nursing care within the same site is very important as it means that our residents only need to make one move. It also allows couples to remain close to each other despite any differences in the level of care that they need individually. Our residents live in our villages for extended periods of time, if not the rest of their lives.
- 37 Ryman's villages also provide extensive onsite amenities to meet the needs of our residents – such as a bar and restaurant, entertainment facilities, recreation facilities, communal sitting areas, bowling green and attractive landscaped gardens. These amenities are purpose-built to meet the needs of our residents, building on our extensive experience over the last 35+ years. These features provide significant positive benefits for residents, many of whom are frail and have limited mobility, as well as for the efficient management and operation of the retirement village.
- 38 The provision for the full range of retirement living and care options, and extensive onsite amenities are fundamental differences between a comprehensive care retirement village, such as the Proposed Village, and lifestyle villages or a smaller rest home. Inevitably these features also result in a built form and layout that differs from those typically experienced in residential areas. Importantly, all the care rooms and community amenities need to be located in the village centre to meet the operational needs of the village and expectations of residents for safe and convenient access between these areas.

39 A series of images of Ryman villages are attached as **Appendix 1** so that you can get a sense of what our villages look and feel like. I am happy to arrange a visit to one of our established villages if that would be useful.

Our residents

40 The layout and environment of Ryman's villages are designed to meet the specific physical and social needs of elderly people.

41 Our residents are generally much more vulnerable than the general population and have different levels of need, ranging from those who are independent to those requiring a high level of 24 hour specialist care, such as that provided in our dementia units. Our independent living residents have an average age of 82. Our serviced and aged care residents have an average age of 87.

42 When residents move into the village, they are elderly, may be frail, many have on-going chronic conditions, and they are beginning to experience reduced mobility and age-related memory impairment. Many will be widows or widowers. Most hospital residents are not independently mobile. Dementia residents are in a secure environment and need to be accompanied when outside. Safety, security and ease of access to village amenities are highly important. It is important that communal areas are not too hot, too cold or too bright, as some elderly people find such extremes difficult.

43 Ryman has programmes in place to encourage all of our residents to be as active as their health permits, and as independent as possible for as long as possible. For example, we designed an age-specific low impact cardio programme called Triple A. We also have swimming pools, indoor and outdoor bowls, accessible walkways and high quality landscaped areas. We employ an activities manager to encourage our residents to engage in as much daily group and social activity as possible.

44 For our residents who are no longer capable of independent living and who have limited mobility, we have a philosophy of "*bringing the world to your window*". We strive to have activity happening across the village and especially within and around the buildings. While you and I may not necessarily find it interesting, watching people arriving and leaving the village is enjoyed by many of our residents.

45 Ryman also ensures that its villages are blended into established, good-quality residential communities. This is vitally important so that the residents continue to function as an integral part of the community. By being located in residential areas, residents are also able to access the services and amenities that these areas provide.

46 All Ryman villages currently operating or in development throughout New Zealand are located within existing suburban, residential

environments, including the present Site. Each village is designed to fit within its surrounds. My view is that each of our established villages are proven to be entirely compatible with their residential environment upon completion.

WHY RYMAN CHOSE THE SITE

- 47 Site selection is very important to ensure that the range of characteristics described above can be achieved.
- 48 Ryman chose the Site, and is committed to providing housing and care at the Proposed Village, for a number of reasons, including:
- 48.1 The Site is the only large, residentially zoned site available in this area that I and my team at Ryman, as retirement and care experts, consider appropriate to provide the best quality of life we can for our residents.
 - 48.2 The Site is located in a pleasant neighbourhood, with a strong sense of local community and an established residential feel.
 - 48.3 The Site is located in close proximity to local amenities that our residents will use and enjoy including supermarkets, a library, cafes, medical centre, dentist, pharmacy and churches.
 - 48.4 There is a lack of suitable retirement accommodation and care options in Karori and the surrounding suburbs, as well as Wellington more broadly.
 - 48.5 The Site previously housed the former Teachers' College, which played an important role within the Karori community. The Proposed Village will play a different, but just as important community role. It is very likely that some of the residents will be either former staff or students from the College.
 - 48.6 The Site previously contained large, tall, education buildings, which had over a long period become part of the character of the wider area. This context enabled us to envisage a large format retirement village sitting comfortably on the Site, while still integrating into the wider neighbourhood and also establishing a new residential character. The Statement of Evidence of Isaac Bright will highlight how the former and retained buildings helped to inform our design strategy.
 - 48.7 I understand that the Operative Plan describes the Site as a "windfall site" and that this description enables opportunities for greater residential density, different residential typologies and building forms. This planning support is well suited to the Proposed Village.

- 48.8 The Site is well-located and easily accessible via pedestrian, road and public transport links. These transport links ensure that it will be convenient for family and friends to visit, meaning our residents remain connected to their loved ones. It will also ensure our staff have convenient access to their workplace.
- 48.9 As part of our due diligence prior to acquiring the Site, we sought independent expert technical advice, including in areas such as planning, legal, traffic, urban design, geotechnical, arboriculture, heritage and civil engineering. The feedback from our experts reinforced our opinion of the Site's suitability for a comprehensive care retirement village.
- 49 Overall, I consider the Site will provide an environment that will enhance the quality of life of our elderly residents. Very importantly, it will allow older people from Karori and surrounding suburbs to 'age in place' with the range of benefits that provides (as I have already described above).

CONSULTATION

- 50 As an initial comment, I note that Ryman has significant experience in developing and operating retirement villages throughout New Zealand. The feedback we get from neighbours of our new villages and local councils is incorporated and reflected in the initial designs of our villages. However, each village is different and local feedback gives us a better understanding of neighbour and other stakeholder concerns. We always look to address and resolve reasonable concerns meaningfully.
- 51 It is fair to say that many of the negative perceptions of having a retirement village as a neighbour do not come to fruition. We want to work with and integrate into the community that we operate within. We are not a developer in the business of making short term gains. Rather, we take our ongoing obligations to the communities we are in very seriously.
- 52 During the conception of the Proposed Village, Ryman has worked closely with the Council. Ryman devoted a significant period of time to pre-application meetings and site visits with Council staff throughout 2019-2020 and to post-application discussions throughout 2020-now. The feedback from Council officers has been taken into account and reflected in the evolution of the Proposed Village, where appropriate and practical. We have sought as much as possible to enable alignment between our experts and the Council experts. I am pleased to see that this collaborative process has resulted in the very positive support for the Proposed Village in the Officer's Report and the planner's recommendation that the village consents be granted.

- 53 Ryman also actively engaged with community members on the resource consents application. We held community drop-in days on 3 and 4 May 2018, 25 and 26 February 2019, 13 and 14 November 2019 and 27 and 28 April 2022. Ryman also met individually with a large number of neighbours, local businesses and community groups throughout 2018 and 2019. Contact with interested persons throughout 2020 and 2021 was predominately limited to phone calls and emails due to Covid-related restrictions. Ryman has had further individual meetings with neighbours in 2022.
- 54 Ryman initially sought limited notification of its application, based on advice from its expert consultants that the design process had ensured the adverse effects of the Proposed Village were very limited. However, in response to community concerns, Ryman sought public notification of the Proposed Village application. As a result, all interested persons have had an opportunity to have their say on the Proposed Village.
- 55 Ryman has continued to engage with Council and submitters following the close of submissions. This engagement has included discussions with Council officers in relation to planning (including conditions) and various expert subject areas, an offer to Scapa Terrace submitters that adjoin the Site for Ryman's landscape/visual and urban design experts to visit their properties to better understand their submissions (taken up by two residents), meetings with Fire and Emergency New Zealand in relation to its submission, and pre-hearing meetings on 9 and 10 August attended by Ryman, the Council reporting officer and various submitters.
- 56 As a result of the consultation prior to and following the lodgement of the application, Ryman made a range of changes to the Proposed Village design. The consultation has also informed the proposed consent conditions. The design iteration process is described in the Statement of Evidence of Mr Bright, and the Statement of Evidence of Richard Turner sets out Ryman's proposed consent conditions.

RESPONSE TO SUBMISSIONS

- 57 A large proportion of the submissions received support the application. A wide range of people have recognised and acknowledged Ryman as a reputable operator and good neighbour, the high quality design of the Proposed Village, the contribution the Proposed Village will make to easing pressure on the public health system and housing market, the economic and employment benefits of the village, and a wide variety of other positive benefits the Proposed Village will provide. For the reasons set out earlier in my evidence, I whole-heartedly agree with these submission points. I also note again the support for the Proposed Village in the submission of the Karori Residents Association, which represents the broader Karori community.

58 The submissions also raise some concerns about the Proposed Village. As noted, Ryman has significant experience in constructing and operating retirement villages throughout New Zealand. The construction of these villages often raises community concerns. While I recognise these concerns are genuine, my experience is that the fears or perception of the issues raised do not actually eventuate from the construction or operation of our villages. Many of our neighbours comment that Ryman is a 'good neighbour' as our villages are well cared for, our residents are respectful community members, and our impacts (such as traffic generation) are less than other residential activities.

59 I will make some general comments as Ryman's representative to explain our perspective on submissions relating to construction effects, consultation, fire safety, the design/scale of the Proposed Village, as well as a range of other matters. Other witnesses will address submitter concerns in more detail.

Construction effects

60 A number of submitters are concerned with control of construction effects, such as traffic and parking, noise and vibration, dust management as well as construction length and hours.¹ Some submitters are also concerned that construction activities could result in damage to nearby properties.²

61 Ryman acknowledges that it is not possible to avoid all effects of construction and there will be some disruptions during the construction of the Proposed Village. However, construction activities are an expected part of living in an urban environment. The Site is vacant and in a desirable location – it is inevitable that it will be intensively developed in some form. Further, our construction activities will be carefully managed in accordance with a comprehensive suite of best practice resource consent conditions and as required under other statutory regimes, such as the Building Act.

62 Unlike most developments of this type, Ryman has its own construction team and will comprehensively manage the construction process. This feature will ensure Ryman has full control and accountability for construction activities. We also employ highly skilled construction teams that are accustomed to building in existing urban environments and managing related impacts. My view is that construction impacts will be temporary, well managed, and in any case, similar or less than what would be expected for any comprehensive development of the Site. I note

¹ Submission 38 (Carruthers), 43 (Wallace), 49 (Gestro), 50 (van Amelsfort), 54 (Brandon), 56 (Cooper), 58 (Moran), 60 (Sprott), 70 (Moore), 72 (Ingham) and 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

² Submission 43 (Wallace), 49 (Gestro), 50 (van Amelsfort), 54 (Brandon), 56 (Cooper), 57 (Leikis & Porter), 60 (Sprott), 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc), 70 (Moore), 72 (Ingham) and 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

that the demolition works were undertaken by a contractor, not Ryman's construction team.

- 63 Ryman will actively minimise construction impacts to the extent practicable. The proposed conditions require a construction management plan (*CMP*) to manage any adverse effects from construction activities. The *CMP* and ancillary management plans will establish appropriate protocols for the management of dust, noise and vibration, traffic, construction hours, removal of contaminated soil and sediment and erosion controls, during construction of the Proposed Village. As part of a *CMP*, it is our usual practice to have a complaints register and active discussions with neighbours throughout the construction phase to assist with identifying and addressing any issues. We will adopt this approach during construction at the Site, including through the proposed community liaison group. In my view, Ryman has an excellent track record of managing construction effects.
- 64 Ryman will also seek to minimise the construction timeframe as much as possible. We expect to have construction completed within 36-40 months. Some submitters have sought reduced construction days and hours,³ however this approach would prolong the overall construction period and not reduce construction impacts overall.
- 65 I note that the construction of the Proposed Village will be carried out in stages. This staged approach will ensure that neighbours are not exposed to construction effects for the total construction timeframe. Additionally, the most disruptive part of construction will be the initial stages of excavation, which will occupy a relatively limited part of the total construction period.
- 66 Ryman's residents will start occupying the Proposed Village while construction continues. We would not expose our own residents to unreasonable noise, dust and other impacts, so this provides extra assurance that construction effects will be well managed by Ryman.
- 67 A number of submitters requested that Ryman honour its offer to undertake house washing.⁴ As noted above, Ryman will carefully manage construction to manage potential dust impacts. Nevertheless, Ryman routinely makes this offer to provide peace of mind to neighbours. I understand this offer has been recorded in the proposed consent conditions.⁵

³ Submission 22 (Powell), 62 (Dunstan), 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc), 70 (Moore) and 73 (van Amelsfort).

⁴ Submission 49 (Gestro), 54 (Brandon), 56 (Cooper), 60 (Spratt), 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc), 70 (Moore), 72 (Ingham) and 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

⁵ Ryman Healthcare Limited 'Proposed Comprehensive Care Retirement Village – 21 Donald Street and 37 Campbell Street: Proposed Consent Conditions' 5 August 2022, Condition 5(f).

68 A number of submitters also requested that Ryman honour its offer to undertake pre and post-construction building condition surveys and remedy any damage. As explained in the evidence of Mr Pierre Malan, no damage to neighbouring properties is anticipated as a result of construction of the Proposed Village. Nevertheless, Ryman routinely makes this offer to provide peace of mind to neighbours. I understand this offer is to be recorded in the proposed consent conditions.

Consultation

69 Some submitters suggested there has been inadequate consultation between Ryman and members of the community in relation to the Proposed Village.⁶

70 I believe the degree of consultation undertaken to date has been appropriate. As set out earlier in my evidence, Ryman has engaged with the community and Council over a lengthy period of time. Ryman has made substantial amendments to the design of the Proposed Village in response to feedback and has also addressed a number of matters in its proposed conditions of consent.

71 Ryman will also continue to engage with the community throughout the construction process, as it does for all of its villages. Ryman will employ a project manager who will be the touch point for the community during construction. Ryman will also send regular newsletters to owners and occupiers of properties near the Site to keep them up to date on construction activities. Ryman will also offer a condition requiring it to invite Responsible Development Karori to participate in a community liaison group, and I note we have used such a condition successfully on other recent projects.

Fire and Emergency New Zealand

72 The submission of Fire and Emergency New Zealand (*FENZ*) addresses the fire safety design for the Proposed Village.

73 Ryman is of course also concerned to ensure its Proposed Village is safe for our future residents, staff and visitors and fire service teams entering our Site in emergencies. That said, I was surprised to receive the FENZ submission. Ryman has a good working relationship with FENZ across the country, having built 38 New Zealand retirement villages, and upgraded and extended many of those villages. As far as I am aware, Ryman has an excellent track record of addressing fire safety matters and receiving, and complying with, appropriate statutory approvals.

74 We have also not in the past needed to address fire safety matters, to the level of detail being sought by FENZ in this case. At this stage

⁶ Submission 56 (Cooper), 57 (Leikis & Porter), 60 (Sprott) and 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc).

of the development process, Ryman has a fire engineering concept design for the Proposed Village, but not a detailed design.

- 75 In any case, my team and our independent experts have met with FENZ to better understand its position with a view to resolving the key issues. I understand that FENZ essentially wants Ryman to agree to a fire access solution for the Site now, despite these matters normally being dealt with as part of the Building Consent process. Ryman's independent experts have put forward an outline of an indicative FENZ attendance scheme (as outlined in the Statement of Evidence of Brady Cosgrove). FENZ has not accepted that scheme to date, despite, as I understand it, FENZ officers acknowledging that the scheme would likely receive a Building Consent.
- 76 Ryman will of course keep talking to FENZ in good faith as we progress our detailed design. However, in my view it is not appropriate for FENZ to seek to use the resource consent process to secure an outcome that is managed through different statutory processes. Ryman is highly concerned that it could be prejudiced in relation to those usual processes and our statutory rights, including appeals, if we are forced to accept FENZ's preferred solution now. Such specificity could also impact on the development of our detailed design and other Building Consent requirements, which all need to be considered holistically.

Scale/design of the Proposed Village

- 77 A number of submitters have raised general concerns regarding the scale and design of the Proposed Village.⁷
- 78 Ryman is aware that nearby residents are sometimes highly concerned about changes in the area surrounding their home, such as construction of a retirement village. My experience is that often these generalised concerns do not play out into actual issues. While the Proposed Village will change the nature of the Site, this would be true for any development on the Site.
- 79 While we designed the proposal to meet the planning outcomes of the Operative District Plan, I understand the broader neighbourhood is now anticipated to accommodate much greater changes in character as a result of recent legislative and planning changes, further supporting intensive development on the Site. In my view, development of the Site is to be expected and encouraged, as it has been unused for some time.
- 80 I consider that the impacts of the Proposed Village on the look and feel of the community will be positive. Ryman has put considerable

⁷ Submission 16 (Tyler), 39 (McArdle), 40 (Minson), 43 (Wallace), 50 (van Amelsfort), 53 (MacLaren), 54 (Brandon), 56 (Cooper), 57 (Leikis & Porter), 60 (Sprott), 62 (Dunstan), 73 (King) and 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

effort into developing and refining the design of the Proposed Village. The Proposed Village has been through numerous iterations with input from its project team specialists, the Council and other parties. Ryman is very proud of the current design. I firmly believe the configuration and design of the Proposed Village responds well to the surrounding urban environment, and it will make a positive contribution to the character of the neighbourhood.

- 81 I reiterate that the scale and design of the Proposed Village responds to the functional and operational needs of a comprehensive care village and the expectations of our residents. It is not possible or desirable to build a comprehensive care village that matches the built form and layout of standalone housing on individual plots. The Proposed Village must be of sufficient scale to provide a range of living environments, incorporate communal amenities, and ensure our residents and staff can move around easily and safely. The design must also ensure it is efficient to operate and that it will thrive in the long term.
- 82 Some submitters refer to the scale/design of other Ryman villages.⁸ Ryman designs each of its villages to respond to the particular characteristics of the individual site and surrounding neighbourhood. Each of its villages are therefore bespoke. Ryman has also adapted its design approach over the years in response to operational requirements, resident needs and learnings from consenting processes. Our newer villages are therefore quite different from our older villages.
- 83 Finally, I consider these submission points also do not take into account the desperate need for retirement living and care in the area. In my opinion, elderly residents are entitled to access appropriate housing and care and remain in their own communities during retirement. Some submitters seek substantial reductions to the scale of the Proposed Village, which would see many older people miss out on much needed purpose-built housing and care.

Other matters

- 84 I also wish to briefly address a range of other matters raised in submissions:
- 84.1 A number of submitters identified that the Landscaping Plan proposed the planting of inappropriate species along the southern boundary.⁹ Ryman has updated the Landscaping Plan to address this concern, as contained in the updated drawings package.

⁸ Submission 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc).

⁹ Submission 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc) and 72 (Ingham).

- 84.2 Two submitters have stated that Ryman is attempting to override the Operative Plan to maximise profits.¹⁰ As described earlier in my evidence, Ryman prides itself on providing quality care and retirement housing. The design of its villages is driven by the operational needs of the village and expectations of its residents. Nevertheless, as described earlier, the Proposed Village has been carefully designed to minimise impacts on neighbours and the surrounding environment.
- 84.3 Two submitters commented on the 'loss' of community amenities and one submitter suggested more community space should be provided.¹¹ While the Site was previously publicly owned and provided community amenities, it has been privately owned for some time. During the design and consenting process, Ryman has left the former playing fields open for public use and has provided rubbish bins and undertaken lawnmowing. Other parts of the Site have been fenced to attempt to secure the Site due to health and safety risks and to minimise vandalism. Looking forward, the Proposed Village will provide much needed, purpose-built housing and care for older persons, and will therefore continue the Site's contribution to the community. I note that the Proposed Village will also provide a publicly accessible pocket park on Donald Street. It will also secure ongoing pedestrian access along the pathway on the northern boundary of the Site, parts of which are currently in Ryman ownership.
- 84.4 One submitter was concerned that the pocket park would be detrimental to her enjoyment of her property.¹² Ryman has agreed to construct a higher 1.8m fence along this boundary to address the submitter's concern.
- 84.5 One submitter requested that the existing boundary fencing with mature foliage be retained.¹³ Ryman carefully considered this request, however it was opposed by an adjacent neighbour. The existing fencing and foliage is also dilapidated. Accordingly, Ryman intends to replace the fencing in this location.
- 84.6 One submission asserted that there was no evidence of retirement village demand in Karori.¹⁴ Paragraphs 27-33 and

¹⁰ Submission 73 (King) and 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

¹¹ Submission 43 (Wallace), 53 (MacLaren) and 68 (Taylor).

¹² Submission 17 (Healy).

¹³ Submission 70 (Moore).

¹⁴ Submission 75 (King & McKinnon-King).

10 above address this submission point and demonstrating the need for retirement housing not only in Karori, but also more widely across Wellington. I note also that a number of submissions emphasise the need for the Proposed Village.¹⁵

84.7 One submitter requested that the Proposed Village incorporate further sustainability initiatives.¹⁶ Ryman is a Toitū 'carbonreduce' certified organisation – we've measured our carbon footprint and have developed an emissions management and reduction plan. Ryman is also a member of the New Zealand Green Building Council. A full list of Ryman's 'Principles of Sustainable Design' and 'Sustainability initiatives' are at **Appendix 2** to this evidence.

RESPONSE TO COUNCIL OFFICER'S REPORT

85 Ryman's independent experts have addressed the key matters in relation to the Officer's Report and I have no further material comments on those. Ryman generally supports the Council's recommended conditions subject to the changes recommended by our experts, which is addressed in the Statement of Evidence of Mr Turner.

CONCLUSION

86 I strongly believe that our Proposed Village is urgently needed by residents in the Karori and wider Wellington area. Ryman already has a list of 440 people who have expressed an interest in living in the Proposed Village.

87 The Site is also well-suited for our Proposed Village. It has been very well designed and addresses its effects on our neighbours and the community. It will have significant positive effects on the wider community, and of course will have very positive effects on the people that will reside there, as well as their families.

88 Once completed, the Proposed Village and the care that we provide will be a valuable community asset. It will ensure that all members of the community will have their residential and care requirements provided for and available.

Matthew Glen Brown
29 August 2022

¹⁵ Submission 9 (Lamb) and 14 (Jansen).

¹⁶ Submission 65 (Responsible Development Karori Inc).

APPENDIX 1



Riccarton Park, Christchurch



Riccarton Park, Christchurch



Hobsonville, Auckland



Lincoln Road, Auckland - Miriam Corban Village



Lincoln Road, Auckland - Miriam Corban Village



Aberfeldie, Melbourne



Ocean Grove, Bellarine Peninsula



Ocean Grove, Bellarine Peninsula



Burwood East, Melbourne - John Flynn Village

VILLAGE EXTERIORS



Independent Apartment Living



Independent Apartment Living



Independent Apartment Bedroom



Independent Townhouse Living



Typical Independent Bathroom



Typical Independent Kitchen



Serviced Apartment Living



Serviced Apartment Living & Kitchenette



Serviced Apartment Bedroom

VILLAGE INTERIORS



Beauty Salon



Cinema



Games Room



Gym



Spa & Pool



Cafe



Bar & Lounge



Bowling Green

VILLAGE AMENITIES

APPENDIX 2



Ryman Healthcare Principles of Sustainable Design

Our Objective: To maximise, as far as practicable, the use of sustainable design principles into our architectural design processes.

Item No:	Design Principle:	Strategy:
1	It's all about our Residents	<i>"To keep our residents' care, comfort, security and accessibility needs at the heart of all of our design decisions."</i>
2	Treat as Unique	<i>"To treat each design project as separate and 'unique' and to incorporate specific local environmental and community aspects into each project. Agreement on key project decisions will be reached prior to the start of each project."</i>
3	In it for the Long-Haul	<i>"To deliver functional, durable and aesthetically pleasing designs that will last."</i>
4	Energy Efficiency	<i>"To maximise energy-efficiency through innovation, an open-minded approach and the effective use of modern technology."</i>
5	Keep it Natural	<i>"To utilise natural lighting and ventilation wherever possible."</i>
6	Efficient Water Use	<i>"To design and implement efficient water management strategies and systems."</i>
7	Manage Waste	<i>"To incorporate designs that minimise waste as far as practicable."</i>
8	Maintain Wellbeing	<i>"To specify and utilise low- or non-toxic materials wherever possible."</i>
9	Make the Impact Low	<i>"To consider environmental impacts as a key factor in our design decisions, and minimise any impacts as far as practicable."</i>
10	A Sense of Community	<i>"To incorporate the needs of local communities and related infrastructure into our design processes."</i>
11	Stay Informed	<i>"To communicate sustainable aspects of projects for informational and educational purposes."</i>



Ryman Healthcare Sustainability Initiatives

Our Objective: To support Ryman's overall sustainability strategy through proactive and focussed sustainability initiatives.

Development/Design:

- Utilising groundwater bores for irrigation, as permitted under the resource consent process.
 - Saves potable water use.
- Using stormwater retention tanks that filter/clean water before entry into waterways.
- Improving landscaping and utilising more native plant varieties.
- Retaining existing vegetation on sites, where practicable.
- Removing ground contamination and disposing of it at accredited facilities, where practicable.
- Low traffic generation – Ryman's typical traffic generation is ~20% of a standard residential development.
- Designing buildings utilising low-maintenance materials, wherever possible.
- Reducing the overall residential building footprint by designing and building quality, high-density residential retirement living options upwards rather than outwards.
- Implementation of Ryman's Principles of Sustainable Design.
- Incorporating electric vehicle (EV) charging stations into new Village designs.

Construction:

- Participating in Waste Management's Resource Recovery Program for our Auckland-based sites.
 - Working on similar options in Christchurch and Wellington.
 - In Victoria, Australia, ~85% of waste taken off site is recycled.
- Conducting a solar tile trial at the Anthony Wilding and James Wattie Villages.
- Consulting with an external energy consultant to discuss possible energy reduction options.

Property:

- Staggering the hours of Village laundry operations to reduce peak loading.
- Replacing fluorescent lamps and halogen lamps with LED lamps.
- Installing motion sensors for lighting in Village common areas.
- Removing green waste from Village waste streams using dedicated 'green' skips.
- Increasing recycling awareness amongst our Village residents through on-site education programmes.
- Removing R22 gas from air-conditioning plant in our Villages.
- Implementation of a Contractor Education Programme, e.g. for paint recycling, the correct disposal of HVAC units, etc.
- Recycling surplus furniture and equipment, where practicable.
- Investing in irrigation sensors and other technology to reduce unnecessary watering.
- Annual composting at Villages to increase mulching and water retention.

Other:

- Introduction of The Graeme Rabbits Sustainability Innovation Award.
- Introduction of Ryman re-useable jute bags.
- Membership of the Toitu carbon measurement and reduction programme.
- Membership of the New Zealand Green Building Council.

Procurement:

- Prioritising supplier ethical and environmental policies, whenever possible.
- Transitioning the company vehicle fleet to hybrid vehicles.
- Operating electric vehicle (EV) 'taxis' at selected Villages.
- Installation of EV charging stations at selected existing Villages.
- Introduction of discounted re-usable cups for staff and residents.
- Negotiating with suppliers to remove packaging from goods when delivered to our Villages/sites.
- Introduction of segregation bins for rubbish in the Christchurch office.
- Membership of Air New Zealand's 'FlyNeutral' program.
- Implementation of the Ryman Sustainability Framework.
- Moving from latex to nitrile gloves.

Finance:

- Liaising with the ANZ on Green/Social bonds – still in the early-stages of exploring this.
- Working on producing an ESG/Sustainability report to better answer the increased level of sustainability-related questions from funders/investors.

Offices:

- Recycling used florescent lighting tubes.
- Investigating clearer labelling on the 'Recycling' and 'Landfill' rubbish bins – we can potentially reduce contamination from ~60% to ~15%.
- Sourcing recyclable and sustainably-made stationery and general office products of similar value and quality, wherever possible, e.g. compostable teabags and recyclable packaging.
- Choosing printing paper that is packaged in recyclable wrapping.

- Engaging in a joint initiative with the Department of Conservation to supply predator traps made by Ryman residents for DOC's Nina Valley and Medbury reserves conservation programmes.
- Engaging in a joint venture with Predator Free New Zealand to supply predator traps made by Ryman residents for use around New Zealand.